

# NTIA

transparency of specific behaviors  $6/30/50/10$   $2/3/3/0$

- Maintain intermediary protections

- Prioritizing Key elements  $70/70/5/5$   $1/2/2/0$  Not overload consumers with too much info

- Needs specificity - clear guidance to companies  $30/30/15/2$   $1/2/15/0$

- Technology neutrality  $10/3/4/50$   $0/1/3/1$   $4/0/1/1$

- Platform agnostic  $85/25/0/1$  Identify all players

= Clarity on who is being transparent +  $25/40/15/1$   $0/5/0/0$

- clear statement of privacy rights  $12/3/15/35$   $8/1/1/0$

- Wide adoptions - avoid exceptions  $10/10/8/12$   $3/2/2/2$

- Sliding Scale for Notice  $10/30/25/5$   $2/1/3/4$

- Notice can happen outside of app  $1/1/20/50$   $3/1/4/1$

- Consumer experience

- transparency to policy makers  $5/1/20/60$   $3/1/0/3$

- transparency to advocates

= how to make actionable in global environment

Risk Assessment

- Disclosure of risk

- Prior to install notice

- Functional description of data use ✓  
100/15/0/0 5/3/0/0

- What data outside of app functionality  
(e.g. contact list) 110/3/0/0 6/2/0/0

- Tracking other uses of device

- Dashboard for data uses

- Understand economics of data use 50/30/1/0

- Why data is collected 4/4/1/0

- How to be effective on mobile device

- Standardized definitions of mobile permissions + APIs

- Preload / install / real time

= look at platforms + ~~and~~ Ad networks

NTIA

- App must have Privacy policy
- Where info given
- Need other elements of FIIPPs
- Need to establish dialogue
- ~~Need~~ Capture all elements
- Mobile market data ecosystem
- Size of privacy policy / Simple language answers
- Security
- Device appropriate
- Transparency alone has value

80 / 15 / 5 / 10  
3 / 3 / 0 / 11

Just in time notification ~~X~~

short script / iconography

Just in time re: location ~~X~~

Notice IN context  $\frac{50}{25} / \frac{5}{0} \frac{3}{3} / \frac{1}{1}$  ~~X~~

ICONS  $\frac{20}{30} / \frac{10}{5}$   $\frac{1}{4} / \frac{1}{1}$

- avoid limiting competitiveness
- consistent with existing law
- shared devices
- individual control
- law enforcement angle
- careful about what might be prohibited
- Not too granular - seek Broad based principles
- flexibility

NTIA

- Safeguards for teens
- Understandable to teens/kids  
for sites aimed at/knowledge of t/k

~~12/4/22/20~~

2/1/0/1

= Tools for data transparency ]

2/3/10/30

~~2/2/3/1~~

- Benefits of data

- Types

- Uses

- Choices

- Placement

15/5/4/20

3/1/1/6

- Gather info on practices

- Broader view of contemporary practices

Fact  
Findings

- Understandable by all

- Concise

NTIA - Identify common practices in use today

\* common consumer friendly vocabulary

\* Need to define mobile App

\* Transparency at App level

- Accountability/enforceable  
- Independent verification (of consumer understanding)  
- Standardization

≡ Machine readable disclosure (actionable disclosure)

- Categorization of data

- Categorization of practices

- Include All users  
- Put consumers first  
- Think like a developer

Consistency across apps

- Teachable  
- ~~As well~~

=> Broader education + awareness raising

— small # of topics  $\Rightarrow$  multiple competing drafts  
40/25/1/4    2/2/1/0

— ~~App~~ involve App developers  
50/20/0/0    5/4/0/0

— working groups  $\Rightarrow$  focus on sub issues  
70/30/0/2    3/4/0/0

— list serv — mailing list 8/15/20/20  
5/5/1/3/0

— multiple list servs

— regular calls with IRC chat 0/7/25/40

— full transparency 40/6/10/4    2/3/1/0    0/0/3/2

— Archive 2/6/10/30    1/4/0/1

— look at common/current practises 80/5/2/0    1/1/0/0

— Open process

— closed process 0/5/0/35    1/0/1/5

— hybrid open/closed process  
40/3/4/20    2/2/0/0

Workshop re data collection  
fact gathering method

legislative output / process <sup>8/4/8/40</sup> <sup>1/3/1/1</sup>

parity for consumer groups <sup>20/7/20/1</sup> <sup>3/1/2/1</sup>

de-centralized process

pull in prior written comments <sup>25/10/12/3</sup> <sup>3/3/0/0</sup>

[Adobe Connect or other tech tools to <sup>8/45/20/3</sup> <sup>0/3/1/0</sup>

facilitate discussion <sup>4/15/20/8</sup> <sup>2/1/3/0</sup>

Factual research by staff

ANSI procedures <sup>1/0/3/30</sup> <sup>0/0/3/0</sup>

FTC involvement <sup>25/8/12/10</sup> <sup>5/3/1/0</sup>

- Hold events across country <sup>12/8/15/22</sup>
- Remote participation <sup>4/1/1/1</sup>
- Notice of materials in advance <sup>35/8/2/0</sup>
- Balance of load for small participants <sup>12/15/12/3</sup> <sup>3/2/2/0</sup>
- NO Numerical Voting - other tools for consensus
- Need for senior level input <sup>18/5/0/0</sup> <sup>5/2/1/0</sup>
- ~~NTIA~~ <sup>15/30/10/0</sup> <sup>2/2/10/0</sup> Representative involvement
- Focus on end of process <sup>30/15/5/10</sup> <sup>1/2/10/0</sup>
- identify problem set <sup>40/20/0/1</sup> <sup>5/1/0/0</sup>
- [NTIA suggested timetable, milestones]
- [NTIA provided room <sup>1/1/5/30</sup> <sup>2/0/2/0</sup>]
- Outline of potential solution areas <sup>12/10/7/3</sup> <sup>3/0/1/0</sup> <sup>focus</sup>