Request for Comments on Developing the Administration’s Approach to Consumer Privacy

"User" refers to U.S. citizens or customer of U.S. company regardless of citizenship.

User data may include personally identifiable information, behavioral analytics and telemetry, sentiment, financial transactions, personal communication transactions and device logs, sensor data, and identifiers.

Security of Data

Specific requirements for user and administrator authentication. Data must be secured in transit and at rest.

Firewalls, intrusion detection, and prevention must be implemented.

Perform annual audits by a third party.

Ensure timely security updates to software products and hardware involved in collection, transmission, and storage of data.

User Consent and Disclosure

Opt-in is preferred versus opt-out

Collection and Personalization should be controllable.

Example: Some people not only want Google to cease advertisement personalization but also not log their visits across the web. Collection should cease altogether.

Companies must prominently disclose any third parties and affiliates who have access to data and what specific types of data are collected and/or transferred to third parties prior to and remain accessible to the end user. The user must receive notification during collection and information on the frequency and amount of data prior to collection. All entities must be represented and individually consented at time of collection and previews of the data each entity collects must be accessible by the user.

Every company represented by a product or service must be disclosed and have individual consent, and ability for end user to preview the actual data that is sent from the user to the
company.

If permissions are permanent they must give the option to consent once.

Example: LastPass Password Manager Android app contains code provided by and establishes network connections to at least 4 additional companies: Facebook Graph, Fiksu, Crashlytics, Segment. This is a password manager that can have Accessibility permission, Draw Over Other Apps, and Usage Access on a mobile device—each of which has the ability to observe a lot of user interactions. Therefore, each company represented by the host app must present option for consent, provide a preview of the data they want to collect, and alert the user when that data is being collected.

Entities must report what data is collected of the user on an annual basis.

**Ability to Export Data**

The user must have the ability to export the data in acceptable standard formats for each type of collected data if they so choose. Examples of standard formats include plain text, xml, json, csv, jpg, png, bmp, tiff, or any other open standard.

**Entities Acting as Intermediary to Facilitate Transactions or Communication**

If an entity acts as an intermediary to another entity to process the transaction, the intermediary must not be able to view or store the data and each transaction must use a unique identifier. Example: if a user makes a purchase on a credit card machine or online shopping cart, the merchant does not need to see the credit card number nor pass a credit card number. Instead, transmit a unique identifier for that transaction for that particular account so that an attacker cannot collect credit card numbers for later reuse.

**Opting Out and Requests for Deletion**

To opt-out or remove data, the user must not have to provide more information to verify their identity than what they have collected. That is, the user must not have to mail a copy of a driver's license, write a letter, or provide additional identifiers to verify identity than what the entity has.

To request deletion of user data the user must be able to request deletion electronically, it must be an easily discoverable feature. Opt-out or deletion procedures must be free of charge to the end-user.

Opt-out should not require persistence or maintenance. Technologies such as opt-out cookies or routine renewals put undue burden on a user.

Example: the Network Advertising Alliance [http://optout.networkadvertising.org](http://optout.networkadvertising.org) allows users to opt-out of data collection from several advertising and analytic companies via a browser cookie or mobile application. If the user uninstalls the mobile application or deletes the browser cookie, collection and personalization must not resume. Therefore, this is not a valid persistent opt-out. Google, The Digital Advertising Alliance, TRUSTe, Allspark are other entities that offer and require apps or browser extensions to maintain some form of opt-out.
control. This puts a lot of burden on users to have knowledge of each
technology to maintain consent nor is it all-inclusive of the thousands of
other companies that do not offer such mechanism.

If the user requests a company to delete data, regardless of anonymization, they must delete all
rows and data in their systems and backups. Not a delete/hidden flag but a hard delete. In
some industries, such as healthcare, databases are not designed to hard delete data. Patient data
critical and requires auditing. There may be a "delete flag" that is flipped in a row in the
database but the record still exists on the backend. If the database is compromised, the attacker
can see this soft deleted data because it is still present. Behavioral analytics is not crucial to
keep.

Anonymization does not supersede the user’s choice to opt-out or remove their data. If the
user does not want their data collected, it must be removed even if it was anonymized.

Opt-out and deletion should take no longer than 30 days with an optional choice to rescind
request within the 30 days at the company's discretion. An example might be the user requests
deletion, has the choice to undo the request for 14 days, after which the company has 16 days
to proceed with deleting.

If deletion is unfeasible, the data can optionally be scrambled.