Applicant Name: C & W Communications Inc.

_______________________Public Notice Submissions_______________________

-----Service Area: Polk

Submitter: Windstream

Comment: Windstream’s data strongly suggest that the proposed funded service area likely does not qualify as an underserved area. Windstream offers facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service (meeting the definition set forth in the Notice of Funds Availability) to some of the households in the proposed funded service area, and such households can readily subscribe to Windstream’s broadband service upon request. Windstream also has reason to believe that competitive broadband offerings are available in exchanges overlapping the proposed funded service area. Given this information, agency officials should further investigate existing broadband offerings within the proposed funded service area, so that officials can be sure that the area, in fact, qualifies as underserved.

Windstream is a communications and entertainment company with more than 1 million broadband customers in 16 states. Investing more than $200 million in broadband deployment over the last several years, Windstream now offers approximately 89% of its 3 million voice customers access to quality and affordable broadband service.

The agencies define an “underserved area” as follows: “Underserved area means a proposed funded service area, composed of one or more contiguous census blocks meeting certain criteria that measure the availability of broadband service and the level of advertised broadband speeds. These criteria conform to the two distinct components of the Broadband Infrastructure category of eligible projects—Last Mile and Middle Mile. Specifically, a proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for last mile projects if at least one of the following factors is met, though the presumption will be that more than one factor is present: 1. No more than 50 percent of the households in the proposed funded service area have access to facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service at greater than the minimum broadband transmission speed (set forth in the definition of broadband above); 2. No fixed or mobile broadband service provider advertises broadband transmission speeds of at least three megabits per second (“mbps”) downstream in the proposed funded service area; or 3. The rate of broadband subscribership for the proposed funded service area is 40 percent of households or less. A proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for Middle Mile projects if one interconnection point
terminates in a proposed funded service area that qualifies as unserved or underserved for Last Mile projects.”

Submitter: Allegiance Communications

Comment: Allegiance Communications (Allegiance) currently provides a wide array of broadband offerings within the proposed funded service area. Allegiance has offered broadband services in excess of the 3 MB bandwidth requirement as set forth in the ARRA, NOFA and BIP/BTOP guidelines, all prior to the ARRA approval. Allegiance’s service area already provides for “sufficient access to broadband service to facilitate rural economic development”, as well as allows for choice of service providers through competing with Local Exchange Carriers, and allows for leasing of services through our own facilities. Allegiance’s opinion of the proposed funded service area is that of excess spending where funds could be better used in other portions of the country to deploy broadband service in accordance with the ARRA, NOFA and BIP/BTOP programs. Through funding the proposed service area, excessive competition will be created for all, which may create a short term economic boost, but have severe long term ramifications which may force service providers out of business.

------Service Area: Howard

Submitter: Walnut Hill Telephone Co.

Comment: Walnut Hill Telephone Company demonstrates that the area C & W Communications, Inc. proposes to serve which overlaps Walnut Hill Telephone’s service area does not meet all of the criteria which categorize an area as underserved.

As demonstrated, 100% of households in Walnut Hill Telephone’s service area, including those areas which are part of C & W Communications, Inc.’s proposed funded service area, are able to readily subscribe upon request to facilities-based, terrestrial broadband services at a minimum transmission speed of greater than 768 kbps downstream and 200 kbps upstream from Walnut Hill Telephone. Therefore, C & W Communications, Inc.’s claim that this overlapping area is underserved due to limited access is incorrect. In addition, Walnut Hill Telephone demonstrates that the rate of broadband subscribership for households in [the part of the proposed funded service area which overlaps Walnut Hill Telephone’s service area][its service area] is significant.
Comment: Windstream’s data conclusively establish that the proposed funded service area does not qualify as an underserved area. Windstream offers facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service (meeting the definition set forth in the Notice of Funds Availability) to households in the proposed funded service area, and such households can readily subscribe to Windstream’s broadband service upon request. Data regarding these broadband offerings, detailed below, establish that the proposed funded service area cannot meet all of the three prongs of the “underserved area” test.

Windstream is a communications and entertainment company with more than 1 million broadband customers in 16 states. Investing more than $200 million in broadband deployment over the last several years, Windstream now offers approximately 89% of its 3 million voice customers access to quality and affordable broadband service.

The agencies define an “underserved area” as follows: “Underserved area means a proposed funded service area, composed of one or more contiguous census blocks meeting certain criteria that measure the availability of broadband service and the level of advertised broadband speeds. These criteria conform to the two distinct components of the Broadband Infrastructure category of eligible projects-Last Mile and Middle Mile. Specifically, a proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for last mile projects if at least one of the following factors is met, though the presumption will be that more than one factor is present: 1. No more than 50 percent of the households in the proposed funded service area have access to facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service at greater than the minimum broadband transmission speed (set forth in the definition of broadband above); 2. No fixed or mobile broadband service provider advertises broadband transmission speeds of at least three megabits per second (“mbps”) downstream in the proposed funded service area; or 3. The rate of broadband subscribership for the proposed funded service area is 40 percent of households or less. A proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for Middle Mile projects if one interconnection point terminates in a proposed funded service area that qualifies as unserved or underserved for Last Mile projects.”

-----Service Area: Hot Spring
Submitter:  Central Arkansas Telephone Cooperative, Inc.

Comment:  In the Donaldson exchange - Central Arkansas Telephone Cooperative (CATC) objects to the classification of the proposed area being designated as underserved. CATC provides access to consumers of facilities-based broadband transmission speeds of at least 768 kilobits to 100% of the Proposed Funded Service Area. Not only does CATC provide services to this area, but two wireless broadband service providers also compete and advertise broadband services of speeds up to 5 megabits in the proposed funded service area. CATC believes that, when coupled with the two broadband wireless providers, the penetration rate of broadband access is over 40% in the proposed service area. CATC has invested extensively in the proposed funded service area to bring consumers the latest broadband technologies. Therefore this application should be rejected based on the above statements.

Submitter:  Windstream

Comment:  Windstream’s data strongly suggest that the proposed funded service area likely does not qualify as an underserved area. Windstream offers facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service (meeting the definition set forth in the Notice of Funds Availability) to some of the households in the proposed funded service area, and such households can readily subscribe to Windstream’s broadband service upon request. Windstream also has reason to believe that competitive broadband offerings are available in exchanges overlapping the proposed funded service area. Given this information, agency officials should further investigate existing broadband offerings within the proposed funded service area, so that officials can be sure that the area, in fact, qualifies as underserved.

Windstream is a communications and entertainment company with more than 1 million broadband customers in 16 states. Investing more than $200 million in broadband deployment over the last several years, Windstream now offers approximately 89% of its 3 million voice customers access to quality and affordable broadband service.

The agencies define an “underserved area” as follows: “Underserved area means a proposed funded service area, composed of one or more contiguous census blocks meeting certain criteria that measure the availability of broadband service and the level of advertised broadband speeds. These criteria conform to the two distinct components of the Broadband Infrastructure category of eligible projects-Last Mile and Middle Mile. Specifically, a proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for last mile projects if at least one of the following factors is met, though the presumption will be that more than one factor is present: 1. No more than 50 percent of the households in the proposed funded
service area have access to facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service at greater than the minimum broadband transmission speed (set forth in the definition of broadband above); 2. No fixed or mobile broadband service provider advertises broadband transmission speeds of at least three megabits per second (“mbps”) downstream in the proposed funded service area; or 3. The rate of broadband subscribership for the proposed funded service area is 40 percent of households or less. A proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for Middle Mile projects if one interconnection point terminates in a proposed funded service area that qualifies as unserved or underserved for Last Mile projects.”

Submitter:  Suddenlink Communications

Comment:  This response conclusively demonstrates that Suddenlink and its competitors already offer robust broadband service within the mapped area of the applicant’s proposed funded service area and that this mapped area is neither unserved nor underserved. Additional information is provided in the uploaded document, including (1) sample marketing material; (2) a guide on how to read the data we entered in the “Existing Broadband Subscribers” section of this response; (3) a summary of the vendor and methodology used for estimating competitive-service subscribers in the mapped area; (4) Suddenlink contact information, should one or more federal agencies have questions or require additional information; and (5) a summary of concerns with the response process and the limitations that process has placed on our ability to provide NTIA/RUS with relevant, timely data.

-----Service Area:  MOntgomery

Submitter:  Windstream

Comment:  Windstream’s data strongly suggest that the proposed funded service area likely does not qualify as an underserved area. Windstream offers facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service (meeting the definition set forth in the Notice of Funds Availability) to some of the households in the proposed funded service area, and such households can readily subscribe to Windstream’s broadband service upon request. Windstream also has reason to believe that competitive broadband offerings are available in exchanges overlapping the proposed funded service area. Given this information, agency officials should further investigate existing broadband offerings within the proposed funded service area, so that officials can be sure that the area, in fact, qualifies as underserved.
Windstream is a communications and entertainment company with more than 1 million broadband customers in 16 states. Investing more than $200 million in broadband deployment over the last several years, Windstream now offers approximately 89% of its 3 million voice customers access to quality and affordable broadband service.

The agencies define an “underserved area” as follows: “Underserved area means a proposed funded service area, composed of one or more contiguous census blocks meeting certain criteria that measure the availability of broadband service and the level of advertised broadband speeds. These criteria conform to the two distinct components of the Broadband Infrastructure category of eligible projects—Last Mile and Middle Mile. Specifically, a proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for last mile projects if at least one of the following factors is met, though the presumption will be that more than one factor is present: 1. No more than 50 percent of the households in the proposed funded service area have access to facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service at greater than the minimum broadband transmission speed (set forth in the definition of broadband above); 2. No fixed or mobile broadband service provider advertises broadband transmission speeds of at least three megabits per second (“mbps”) downstream in the proposed funded service area; or 3. The rate of broadband subscribership for the proposed funded service area is 40 percent of households or less. A proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for Middle Mile projects if one interconnection point terminates in a proposed funded service area that qualifies as unserved or underserved for Last Mile projects.”

Submitter: Suddenlink Communications

Comment: This response conclusively demonstrates that Suddenlink and its competitors already offer robust broadband service within the mapped area of the applicant’s proposed funded service area and that this mapped area is neither unserved nor underserved. Additional information is provided in the uploaded document, including (1) sample marketing material; (2) a guide on how to read the data we entered in the “Existing Broadband Subscribers” section of this response; (3) a summary of the vendor and methodology used for estimating competitive-service subscribers in the mapped area; (4) Suddenlink contact information, should one or more federal agencies have questions or require additional information; and (5) a summary of concerns with the response process and the limitations that process has placed on our ability to provide NTIA/RUS with relevant, timely data.
Comment: Windstream’s data strongly suggest that the proposed funded service area likely does not qualify as an underserved area. Windstream offers facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service (meeting the definition set forth in the Notice of Funds Availability) to some of the households in the proposed funded service area, and such households can readily subscribe to Windstream’s broadband service upon request. Windstream also has reason to believe that competitive broadband offerings are available in exchanges overlapping the proposed funded service area. Given this information, agency officials should further investigate existing broadband offerings within the proposed funded service area, so that officials can be sure that the area, in fact, qualifies as underserved.

Windstream is a communications and entertainment company with more than 1 million broadband customers in 16 states. Investing more than $200 million in broadband deployment over the last several years, Windstream now offers approximately 89% of its 3 million voice customers access to quality and affordable broadband service.

The agencies define an “underserved area” as follows: “Underserved area means a proposed funded service area, composed of one or more contiguous census blocks meeting certain criteria that measure the availability of broadband service and the level of advertised broadband speeds. These criteria conform to the two distinct components of the Broadband Infrastructure category of eligible projects—Last Mile and Middle Mile. Specifically, a proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for last mile projects if at least one of the following factors is met, though the presumption will be that more than one factor is present: 1. No more than 50 percent of the households in the proposed funded service area have access to facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service at greater than the minimum broadband transmission speed (set forth in the definition of broadband above); 2. No fixed or mobile broadband service provider advertises broadband transmission speeds of at least three megabits per second (“mbps”) downstream in the proposed funded service area; or 3. The rate of broadband subscribership for the proposed funded service area is 40 percent of households or less. A proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for Middle Mile projects if one interconnection point terminates in a proposed funded service area that qualifies as unserved or underserved for Last Mile projects.”

Submitter: Allegiance Communications
Comment: Allegiance Communications (Allegiance) currently provides a wide array of broadband offerings within the proposed funded service area. Allegiance has offered broadband services in excess of the 3 MB bandwidth requirement as set forth in the ARRA, NOFA and BIP/BTOP guidelines, all prior to the ARRA approval. Allegiance’s service area already provides for “sufficient access to broadband service to facilitate rural economic development”, as well as allows for choice of service providers through competing with Local Exchange Carriers, and allows for leasing of services through our own facilities. Allegiance’s opinion of the proposed funded service area is that of excess spending where funds could be better used in other portions of the country to deploy broadband service in accordance with the ARRA, NOFA and BIP/BTOP programs. Through funding the proposed service area, excessive competition will be created for all, which may create a short term economic boost, but have severe long term ramifications which may force service providers out of business.

-----Service Area: Clark

Submitter: Windstream

Comment: Windstream’s data strongly suggest that the proposed funded service area likely does not qualify as an underserved area. Windstream offers facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service (meeting the definition set forth in the Notice of Funds Availability) to some of the households in the proposed funded service area, and such households can readily subscribe to Windstream’s broadband service upon request. Windstream also has reason to believe that competitive broadband offerings are available in exchanges overlapping the proposed funded service area. Given this information, agency officials should further investigate existing broadband offerings within the proposed funded service area, so that officials can be sure that the area, in fact, qualifies as underserved.

Windstream is a communications and entertainment company with more than 1 million broadband customers in 16 states. Investing more than $200 million in broadband deployment over the last several years, Windstream now offers approximately 89% of its 3 million voice customers access to quality and affordable broadband service.

The agencies define an “underserved area” as follows: “Underserved area means a proposed funded service area, composed of one or more contiguous census blocks meeting certain criteria that measure the availability of broadband service and the level of advertised broadband speeds. These criteria conform to the two distinct components of the Broadband Infrastructure category of eligible projects-Last Mile and Middle Mile. Specifically, a proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for
last mile projects if at least one of the following factors is met, though the presumption will be that more than one factor is present: 1. No more than 50 percent of the households in the proposed funded service area have access to facilities-based, terrestrial broadband service at greater than the minimum broadband transmission speed (set forth in the definition of broadband above); 2. No fixed or mobile broadband service provider advertises broadband transmission speeds of at least three megabits per second ("mbps") downstream in the proposed funded service area; or 3. The rate of broadband subscribership for the proposed funded service area is 40 percent of households or less. A proposed funded service area may qualify as underserved for Middle Mile projects if one interconnection point terminates in a proposed funded service area that qualifies as unserved or underserved for Last Mile projects.”

Submitter:  Suddenlink Communications

Comment:  This response conclusively demonstrates that Suddenlink and its competitors already offer robust broadband service within the mapped area of the applicant’s proposed funded service area and that this mapped area is neither unserved nor underserved. Additional information is provided in the uploaded document, including (1) sample marketing material; (2) a guide on how to read the data we entered in the “Existing Broadband Subscribers” section of this response; (3) a summary of the vendor and methodology used for estimating competitive-service subscribers in the mapped area; (4) Suddenlink contact information, should one or more federal agencies have questions or require additional information; and (5) a summary of concerns with the response process and the limitations that process has placed on our ability to provide NTIA/RUS with relevant, timely data.